MEMORANDUM

TO: Oversight Board
FROM: Tiffany Bohee, Executive Director
SUBJECT: Adopting environmental review findings pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act and Conditionally approving a Combined Basic Concept and Schematic Design for a new public plaza and pedestrian and bicycle facilities on Blocks 36-37 and the 4th Street right-of-away in Mission Bay to serve the future University of California, San Francisco Medical Center pursuant to the Owner Participation Agreement with FOCIL-MB, LLC

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The University of California, San Francisco ("UCSF") is building a new research campus and Medical Center in Mission Bay South. The Medical Center, located on Blocks 36 to 39 and X-3, will serve women, children and cancer patients. The Medical Center will be built in two phases, with the first phase resulting in a 289-bed specialty hospital, and the second phase of development increasing the capacity to 550-beds. UCSF is in the middle of constructing Phase 1, with an opening date of 2014, with the construction timing of Phase 2 being dependent on the availability of future funding.

The original plans for Mission Bay call for 4th Street, a neighborhood street running through the center of Mission Bay, to bisect what is now the UCSF Medical Center site. 4th Street has not been built yet in this portion of Mission Bay. In order to improve the operations of the hospital and protect patient safety, UCSF has requested that the City of San Francisco close the future 4th Street through the Medical Center to non-emergency vehicular traffic. Instead, UCSF will develop a pedestrian plaza in the middle of the 4th Street public right-of-way ("4th Street Public Plaza"). The design will accommodate pedestrian and bicycle traffic through the site. UCSF has also proposed one to two pedestrian bridges to be constructed in the future to connect the two phases of the Medical Center.

Pursuant to the Owner Participation Agreement ("OPA") for Mission Bay South, UCSF has submitted a combined Basic Concept and Schematic Design ("Schematic Design") application for the 4th Street Public Plaza. Consistent with Resolution No. 11-12 approved by the San Francisco Board of Supervisors, the Oversight Board has land use and design review approval authority for Major Approved Development Projects where enforceable obligations exist. The OPA for Mission Bay South is an enforceable obligation pursuant to the Recognized Obligation Payment Schedules ("ROPS"), approved by the Oversight Board and the State’s Department of Finance.
Successor Agency staff has coordinated a design review process with UCSF that has lasted over a year and included staff from the Planning Department, San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency ("SFMTA"), and the Department of Public Works ("DPW"). In addition, the Mission Bay Citizens Advisory Committee ("CAC") also reviewed the proposed 4th Street Public Plaza design and found it to be a well designed concept. UCSF has been working with the public on the design of the proposed 4th Street Plaza design through its own hospital community process.

The San Francisco Board of Supervisors ("BOS") is required to take several actions to allow the 4th Street Public Plaza to be implemented. In addition, the Mission Bay South Infrastructure Plan needs to be amended by the Mayor and the Director of DPW. The Oversight Board approval of the 4th Street Public Plaza Schematic Design will be conditioned on the finalization of these additional actions by the BOS, Mayor, and DPW.

On May 18, 2012, The Regents of the University of California certified the Final Environmental Impact Report for the University of California, San Francisco Campus Medical Center at Mission Bay – 4th Street Public Plaza Project ("Project FEIR") and adopted environmental findings pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act ("CEQA"). Successor Agency staff has reviewed the Schematic Design for the 4th Street Public Plaza and finds that the Oversight Board can consider approval, relying on the Project FEIR as a responsible agency pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15096, “Process for a Responsible Agency.”

Staff recommends adopting environmental findings pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act and conditionally approving the 4th Street Public Plaza Combined Basic Concept and Schematic Design in Mission Bay South.

DISCUSSION

Background

Enforceable Obligation: Mission Bay South Owner Participation Agreement
The Mission Bay South Owner Participation Agreement between the San Francisco Redevelopment Agency ("Redevelopment Agency") and now, the Successor Agency, and FOCIL-MB, LLC, ("Master Developer"), establishes the protocols for development approvals in Mission Bay South, including the approvals of Basic Concept and Schematic Designs for public open space development. The OPA is an enforceable obligation consistent with ABx1 26 ("AB 26") and is included on the Recognized Obligation Payment Schedules ("ROPS"), approved by the Oversight Board on April 10, 2012 (Resolution No. 5-2012) and May 7, 2012 (Resolution No. 6-2012). The ROPS for January to June 2012 and July to December 2012 were approved by the State’s Department of Finance in a letter to the Successor Agency, dated May 25, 2012.

Furthermore, on January 24, 2012, the BOS adopted Resolution No. 11-12, which, among other things, authorized the Oversight Board to exercise land use, development and design approval
under enforceable obligations for the City’s “Major Approved Development Projects,” which include the Mission Bay South Redevelopment Project.

**UCSF Mission Bay Medical Center**

As part of the original negotiations in 1998, the City and Catellus donated 43 acres to the University of California, San Francisco (“UCSF”) to build a new research campus in Mission Bay South and to help create a catalyst for Mission Bay’s emerging bio-technology cluster. UCSF is a leading public medical research, teaching, and clinical institution and is the second largest employer in San Francisco. UCSF is a State agency, which exempts UCSF from local land use regulations, unless they contractually obligate themselves to comply with specific regulations.

In 2005, UCSF gained site control of Blocks 36-39 from Catellus in Mission Bay South for the construction of a new Medical Center serving children, women and cancer patients. UCSF later purchased another private Mission Bay parcel, Block X-3, for the Medical Center.

At the time that UCSF acquired Blocks 36 to 39 from Catellus, UCSF also entered into a Memorandum of Understanding (“MOU”) with the Redevelopment Agency, committing UCSF to certain design review requirements for the Medical Center and recognizing the potential of pedestrian bridges over 4th Street, among other things. This MOU, which is an enforceable obligation, was later amended to reflect UCSF’s purchase of Block X-3.

The design and construction of the Medical Center will be in two phases of development. Phase 1 of the Medical Center will consist of a 289-bed integrated specialty hospital with distinct facilities for children, women and cancer patients on the east side of 4th Street, and a parking structure and surface parking on the west side of 4th Street. UCSF is in the middle of constructing Phase 1, with an opening date of 2014. The design work for Phase 2 of the Medical Center, which will replace the surface parking on the west side of 4th Street with structured parking and additional hospital buildings to increase the capacity of the Medical Center to 550 beds, has not begun. The construction timing of Phase 2 is dependent on the availability of future funding.

The entire Medical Center site is bounded by Mariposa Street to the south, 16th Street to the north, the future Owens Street to the west, and 3rd Street to the east. The Mission Bay South Redevelopment Plan (“Redevelopment Plan”) calls for 4th Street, a neighborhood street, to run through the Medical Center parcels. **Attachment 1** depicts the location of the UCSF 43-acre research campus, Medical Center site, and 4th Street.

**4th Street Public Plaza Schematic Design**

UCSF has requested that the City of San Francisco allow it to develop a new public plaza within the 4th Street public right-of-way as it travels through the Medical Center, closing it to through non-emergency vehicular traffic. As part of this request, UCSF has submitted a Combined Basic Concept and Schematic Design submittal for the 4th Street Public Plaza for Oversight Board
consideration. The landscape architect for the 4th Street Public Plaza Schematic Design is CMG Landscape Architecture ("CMG").

The proposed 4th Street Public Plaza is located partially within the 4th Street public right-of-way between 16th and Mariposa Streets in Mission Bay South and also extends onto UCSF property on the eastside of the plaza onto Blocks 36 and 37. The Oversight Board only has purview for design approval for areas within the City's 4th Street public right-of-way since UCSF is exempt from local land use regulations. However, the following description of the 4th Street Public Plaza includes the entire extent of the plaza to provide a comprehensive review of the overall design.

The intent of the plaza is to provide for the safe movements of visitors, patients and staff between Phase 1 of the Medical Center on the eastside of 4th Street and the parking and Phase 2 hospital to be located on the westside of 4th Street. In addition, the plaza would retain a north-south bicycle route and allow emergency vehicles access. The 4th Street Public Plaza consists of three primary components: the central plaza area, the western bicycle and pedestrian promenade, and the north and south drop-off cul-de-sacs. Attachment 2 depicts the plan for the 4th Street Public Plaza in Phase 1 of the hospital project, and Attachment 3 depicts the design in Phase 2 of the hospital.

UCSF has also proposed up to two pedestrian bridges to be constructed over 4th Street Public Plaza in the future to connect the two phases of the Medical Center and allow the movement of patients, medical equipment, and supplies between the two facilities. As a result, the 4th Street Public Plaza Schematic Design includes design criteria for two future pedestrian bridges, which would link the two phases of the Medical Center.

The following provides more detail on the three components of the 4th Street Public Plaza, as well as the bridge design criteria:

- **Central Plaza Area:** The central plaza area is primarily a public pedestrian-oriented zone. Attachment 4 depicts the plan for the central plaza area, while Attachment 5 provides an aerial view. The area will serve as a flexible use space that acts as a staging area for events such as farmers’ markets and health fairs. Concrete paving will provide visual interest and help define the key building entrances. The eastern side of the central plaza area is defined by the bench walk, depicted in Attachment 6. A line of wooden benches runs along the front of the face of Phase 1 of the Medical Center, taking advantage of the western exposure for sunny seating.

The central plaza area is bookended by two key design features, an amphitheater on the northern end and a tree grove on the south. The amphitheater provides informal seating on concrete bleachers and scattered wooden seats on the slope, with a stage at the bottom to allow for a range of active programming uses compatible with the Medical Center, such as small scale concerts and lectures. The grassy slope of the amphitheater also provides for informal play opportunities for children and a sunny place for picnicking. The northern side of the amphitheater provides seating and rain protection for people waiting to be picked up at the drop-off.
The tree grove is the southern bookend to the central plaza area. The tree grove contains wood decking and seating beneath a grove of Beltuga nigra “Heritage” trees, as is shown in Attachment 7. The warmth of the wood materials will be reinforced with intimate hanging lights suspended from the tree canopy. This protected space will allow visitors to the Medical Center an escape outside for some private contemplation, and the interesting designs of the concrete seating will act as informal play structures for children.

- **Promenade:** The western edge of the central plaza area is the promenade, a 22-foot wide multi-use pathway with an adjacent eight-foot sidewalk, shown in Attachment 8. The primary use of the promenade is for bicycle and pedestrian movement through the site, though it also will provide access for emergency and service vehicles to the plaza. A double row of Ginko trees will be located on both sides of the multi-use portion of the promenade to clearly define the north-south corridor. By incorporating design features typical of streets throughout Mission Bay, the promenade will visually reinforce that the 4th Street public right-of-way is being preserved for public use. Specifically, the street furniture and lighting fixtures along the promenade will be consistent with the Mission Bay South Streetscape Master Plan and City standards for bike racks. In addition, the promenade will connect to Mission Bay’s larger bicycle network, including the 4th Street bike lanes to the north. Signage and visual cues along the paving will be used to promote the safe interaction of bicycles and pedestrians.

- **Drop-offs:** At the north and south ends of the central plaza area are two vehicular drop-off cul-de-sacs. The drop-offs are necessary to allow for the safe arrival and departure of patients, many of which are limited in their ability to walk from the parking on the west side of 4th Street. Much effort was put into the design of the drop-offs to minimize their appearance and incorporate them into the overall design of the plaza so that they do not dominate the character of the area. The drop-offs use the same concrete pavers used in the plaza area. This signals to the drivers that the drop-offs are part of a larger area serving primarily pedestrians and bicyclists. The rain-gardens in the center of each drop-off also help to minimize the visual impact of the drop-offs and provide on-site stormwater treatment.

- **Bridge Design Criteria:** While not part of the surface improvements of the 4th Street Public Plaza, the Schematic Design submittal includes design criteria that would be applied in the event that UCSF requests to build one or two pedestrian bridges connecting the two phases of the Medical Center over the 4th Street plaza. The design criteria limit the maximum width and minimum and maximum height of the bridges and outline basic design direction.

In addition to the 4th Street Public Plaza, there would be gateway planting areas on the east and west sides of the 16th Street end of 4th Street, as well as at the entrance to the Children’s Hospital entry at the southern drop-off. Since the gateway planting areas are located outside the 4th Street public right-of-way on UCSF’s property and are not part of the 4th Street Public Plaza, they are included in the Schematic Design submittal for context only, but are not considered part of the 4th Street Public Plaza Schematic Design approval.
Design Review Process

City staff has worked very closely with UCSF for more than a year on the proposed 4th Street Public Plaza Schematic Design. Successor Agency staff coordinated a design review process that included staff from the Planning Department, San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency ("SFMTA"), and the Department of Public Works ("DPW"). The various departments are pleased with the outcome of the design of the plaza, and remaining concerns have been addressed in the conditions of approval listed below.

The Mission Bay Citizens Advisory Committee ("CAC") also reviewed the proposed 4th Street Public Plaza design on February 9, 2012. The majority of the CAC were very supportive of the design. CAC members appreciate the hospital’s need for safe access to the hospital and were pleased that the project would result in a new venue for community gathering. Some members raised concerns about the safety of a multi-use promenade shared by bicyclists and pedestrians, as well as wanted to ensure that the design of the plaza did not preclude necessary stops for the UCSF shuttle system. Through its environmental review process, UCSF has reviewed the safety of the promenade design and SFMTA has reviewed the proposed design for safety issues. UCSF is already developing an updated shuttle plan for the Medical Center and research campus.

UCSF has been working with the public on the design of the proposed 4th Street Plaza design through its own community planning process, holding public meetings with the UCSF Community Advisory Group and surrounding neighborhood groups, including the Dogpatch and Potrero Hill Neighborhood Associations. The neighborhoods to the south of the Medical Center especially like the 4th Street Public Plaza proposal since they feel it would provide additional public open space and potentially reduce traffic in their neighborhoods. In addition, the San Francisco Bicycle Coalition has been involved in the review of the design and has expressed its support of the multi-use promenade.

NEXT STEPS

A number of additional approvals, outside the purview of the Oversight Board, are necessary to allow the implementation of UCSF’s 4th Street Public Plaza proposal. Since the 4th Street public right-of-way is owned or held in trust by the City of San Francisco, the BOS must take several actions to allow the 4th Street Public Plaza to be constructed. The following is a summary of the required actions, which are scheduled to be introduced to the BOS in June 2012:

- Approve a Master Agreement between the City and UCSF that includes:
  - a major encroachment permit;
  - a maintenance agreement;
  - easement agreements; and
  - a lease of 4th Street subsurface and air space for UCSF improvements.
- Accept offers of real property and public improvements.
- Make findings of consistency with the City's General Plan.
In addition, the Mission Bay South Infrastructure Plan will need to be amended to allow for the 4th Street Public Plaza and the associated surrounding roadway improvements to address the closure of 4th Street. This Minor Infrastructure Plan Amendment requires approval by the Mayor and the DPW Director. It is anticipated that this amendment would occur prior to the introduction of the necessary BOS legislation.

The Oversight Board’s approval of the 4th Street Public Plaza Schematic Design will be conditioned on the approval of the Minor Infrastructure Plan Amendment and the other related BOS actions required for the 4th Street Public Plaza to be implemented.

CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT

As part of its actions on September 17, 1998 establishing the Mission Bay North and South Redevelopment Project Areas ("Project Areas"), the Redevelopment Agency Commission certified the Mission Bay Final Subsequent Environmental Impact Report ("FSEIR") (Resolution No. 182-98), and adopted CEQA findings, approved a series of mitigation measures, and established a comprehensive system for mitigation monitoring (Resolution No. 183-98). The Board of Supervisors, Planning Commission, and various City departments adopted similar findings and mitigation monitoring plans. The Redevelopment Agency Commission also approved Owner Participation Agreements with the primary land owner, Catellus Development Corporation, the original Master Developer, to provide for comprehensive redevelopment of the Project Areas.

Copies of the full four-volume FSEIR were distributed to the Redevelopment Agency Commission prior to the 1998 certification and adoption of the environmental findings. The FSEIR includes by reference a number of addenda. Copies of the FSEIR have been distributed to the members of the Oversight Board, and are also available for review at the Successor Agency’s offices.

On March 17, 2005, The Regents of the University of California certified a Final Environmental Impact Report for Long Range Development Plan Amendment #2 – Hospital Replacement Program ("LRDP Amendment #2 FEIR"). The LDRP Amendment #2 FEIR considered the environmental impacts of a number of potential hospital replacement scenarios, including two sites in Mission Bay. On the same date, The Regents approved an amendment to its Long Range Development Plan ("LRDP") which stated that the initial phase of hospital replacement will be the development of an approximately 210-bed specialty hospital in the Mission Bay South Project Area.

On November 1, 2005 the Redevelopment Agency Commission approved a MOU to address the fiscal and design implications of UCSF’s development of a hospital on Blocks 36 to 39. Also on November 1, 2005, the Redevelopment Agency Commission approved a Second Amendment to the Mission Bay South OPA with Catellus Operating Limited Partnership and FOCIL-MB, LLC, to allow for the transfer of Blocks 36 to 39 to The Regents. In approving the MOU and amended
OPA, the Redevelopment Agency Commission acted as a “responsible” agency and used the LRDP Amendment #2 FEIR and its accompanying mitigations to adopt environmental findings.

Subsequently, UCSF purchased another private parcel in Mission Bay South, Block X3, and incorporated the site into its Phase 1 hospital design. Accordingly, amendments to the MOU were needed to extend its applicability to Block X3.

On September 18, 2008, The Regents certified a Final Environmental Impact Report for a revised hospital plan for Mission Bay South on Blocks 36-39 and X3 (“MCMB FEIR”). As discussed above, the UCSF Medical Center project included the development of a hospital of up to a 289 beds in Phase I, with additional 261 beds in Phase II. Redevelopment Agency staff prepared a sixth Addendum to the Mission Bay FSEIR dated September 10, 2008 ("Addendum #6"), which studied the possible environmental impacts of the proposed UCSF Medical Center relative to the Redevelopment Plan and the Mission Bay FSEIR. Addendum #6 included a determination that all of the significant impacts that would occur from the UCSF Medical Center project were identified in the Mission Bay FSEIR or would not create any new significant impacts to development allowed under the Redevelopment Plan nor would development allowed under the Redevelopment Plan contribute to a significant cumulative impact. Therefore, the conclusion in Addendum #6 was that the UCSF Medical Center project did not identify any new significant impacts or a substantial increase in the severity of previously identified significant effects that alter the conclusions reached in the Mission Bay FSEIR. The conclusion is consistent with the analysis contained in the MCMB FEIR. The Redevelopment Commission adopted findings incorporating this Addendum into the Mission Bay environmental findings on October 21, 2008 (Resolution No. 125-2008).

Subsequently, on April 22, 2009, The Regents certified a Final Supplemental Environmental Impact Report to analyze a Residential Sound Reduction related to the operations of a helipad at the Medical Center Program (“Final UCSF Helipad SEIR”), which was developed as a result of a mitigation measure in the MCMB FEIR. As the Final UCSF Helipad SEIR solely focused on the analysis of the Residential Sound Reduction Program that addressed potential project-specific helipad noise impacts already identified in the MCMB FEIR, the analysis contained in Addendum #6 covers the Final UCSF Helipad SEIR analysis and no additional addendum was required as a result of the Final UCSF Helipad SEIR.

On March 2, 2010, the Redevelopment Agency Commission approved an amendment to the MOU to incorporate X3 in the hospital plan. In approving the Amended MOU, the Commission acted as a “responsible” agency and used the MCMB FEIR, the Final UCSF Helipad SEIR, and accompanying mitigations to adopt environmental findings.

On May 18, 2012, The Regents certified the 4th Street Public Plaza Project FEIR and adopted environmental findings pursuant to CEQA. As evaluated in the FEIR, development of the 4th Street Public Plaza will not result in any significant and unavoidable impacts. Further the Project FEIR did not identify any project specific mitigation measures; however, The Regents established a Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program that includes all of the mitigation measures identified in the LRDP Amendment #2 FEIR and MCMB FEIR incorporated as part of the project, as described in the Project Description of the Project FEIR.
Successor Agency staff has reviewed the Combined Basic Concept and Schematic Design for the 4th Street Public Plaza and finds that Oversight Board approval will not change the scope of the project analyzed in the Project FEIR and no major revisions are required due to the involvement of new significant environmental effects or a substantial increase in the severity of significant effects previously identified in the FEIR, that no substantial changes have occurred with respect to the circumstances under which the project would be undertaken, and that no new information of substantial importance to the project analyzed in the FEIR has become available.

**STAFF ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATION**

Based on the review process described above, staff believes the proposed Combined Basic Concept and Schematic Design for the 4th Street Public Plaza in Mission Bay South is consistent with the Redevelopment Plan and the Design for Development. Staff finds that CMG has developed an innovative design that provides for the safe and integrated movement of pedestrians, bicycles, and emergency vehicles, while providing an enjoyable public open space that will serve the larger Mission Bay community.

There remain a number of detailed design issues to be resolved in subsequent design stages. Staff recommends the approval of the Combined Basic Concept and Schematic Design for the 4th Street Public Plaza, subject to the conditions of approval included below. As mentioned above, since UCSF is a State agency and is exempt from local land use regulations, the following conditions of approval only apply to the portions of the project in the 4th Street public right-of-way, unless otherwise noted.

1. The approval of the Combined Basic Concept and Schematic Design is contingent on approval of the Minor Mission Bay South Infrastructure Plan amendment by the Mayor and Director of the Department of Public Works, as well as the approval by the San Francisco Board of Supervisors of all the related legislation required to implement the 4th Street Public Plaza by UCSF.

2. Staff shall review and approve the final furnishings for the 4th Street Public Plaza, including bike racks, benches, signage, and light poles during design development. UCSF shall consider the long-term durability, maintenance requirements, and the sustainability of the materials when selecting furnishings.

3. Final hardscape materials for the 4th Street Public Plaza, including all paving materials and patterns, shall be reviewed and approved by staff during the design development. Attention will be given to the shared pedestrian/bicycle promenade, as well as to the pedestrian and vehicle interface at the drop-off, to ensure safe and compatible use by all modes of transportation.

4. A final planting plan for the 4th Street Public Plaza, including all new trees, planting palette, stormwater treatment basins, amphitheater, and tree grove area, shall be reviewed by staff for approval during design development.
5. The lighting plan, including lighting fixtures and locations, shall be reviewed and approved by staff during design development to ensure that the lighting plan promotes the public character of the plaza, as well as defines the promenade as a major north-south public thoroughfare for pedestrians and bicyclists. Attention shall be given to the proposed building parapet flood lights to ensure that they do not overly light the plaza and affect the adjacent neighborhood.

6. Once UCSF completes final designs for Phase 2 of the UCSF Mission Bay Medical Center, UCSF shall work with Successor Agency and City staff to revisit the 4th Street Public Plaza design to determine what modifications, if any, to the plaza may be necessary to accommodate the final design of Phase 2 of the Medical Center. Specific attention will be given to minimizing the size of the drop-offs and retaining a safe movement of pedestrian, bicycle, and emergency vehicles. The approval process for the Phase 2 plaza improvements shall be subject to the Mission Bay South Design Review and Document Approval Procedures, or an alternative City design review process if the Mission Bay South Redevelopment Plan has already expired.

7. The project boundaries shown on Pages 4 and 5 of the Combined Basic Concept and Schematic Design are identified for purposes of developing the Combined Basic Concept and Schematic Design only. The actual project boundaries for purposes of construction and permitting will be determined by Department of Public Works staff.

8. Approval of the Combined Basic Concept and Schematic Design does not constitute approval of the various technical studies completed by UCSF for the preparation of the overall plaza design.

(Originated by Catherine Reilly, Assistant Project Manager)

Tiffany Bohee
Executive Director

Attachments:
Attachment 1: Mission Bay Location Map
Attachment 2: Concept Plan – Phase 1
Attachment 3: Concept Plan – Phase 2
Attachment 4: 4th Street Public Plaza
Attachment 5: Amphitheater – From Bridge
Attachment 6: Bench Walk – Pedestrian
Attachment 7: The Grove – From South
Attachment 8: Multi-Use Promenade – From North
Attachment 9: 4th Street Public Plaza Project FEIR – provided on separate CD