This review of Block 5 Proposals evaluates them in terms of the following criteria:

**Concept**
- Design Concept
- Open Space
- Ground Floor
- Parking
- Sustainability

**Compliance with Applicable Planning Code**
- Building Height
- Bulk Controls
- Open Space
- Parking (TBD)
**Design Concept**
This proposal does not express a larger conceptual idea that establishes its overall architectural language, massing, or site relationships. Instead, it has a set of smaller concepts for each.

Architectural language: The proposal uses a conventional glass curtain wall system to create a façade that expresses a normative rhythm of floorplates and vertical divisions. The exterior primarily reads as a continuous skin.

The design proposal includes three distinct design elements: a curved corner, the veranda rooms, and the building crown. While small and elegant, the curved corner turns between the adjacent driveway and Natoma and will not be viewed likely from the pedestrian level but may be read from afar. The veranda rooms are not very perceptible as a design feature—as a ripple of operable windows—but do provide a nice amenity to building tenants. The highlight feature of this design is the building top which is designed as a crystalline inverted shape read through an open frame. While the frame is the same size as the rest of the upper tower, it will help the tower read as if it diminishes. From afar, this effect will likely work well and give some subtle identity to the project but most of the delicate design intent will not be visible as it is deep into the frame and not viewable from the ground level.

Massing: The proposal conforms to and nearly replicates the given mass and bulk parameters. The mass breaks define open spaces at two levels. Overall the building reads as a stoic and heavy mass.

Site Relationships: The project conforms to expected ground floor use and general district access. The one innovative idea is that the large retail space on Howard can be fully opened up via large folding doors to the public realm. The relationship to Natoma is underdeveloped.

Open Space
Open space is provided on the ground, 11th, and 26th levels. The upper levels do not offer distinguishing features or identities. The publicly-accessible open space on parcel M1 is nicely programmed and designed while Parcel N3 is underdeveloped.

**Planning Code Considerations**

Office use: 698,370 SF
Retail use: 9,500 SF (approx.)

Building Height
The project complies.

Bulk Controls
The project complies with the upper and lower tower portions. They do not indicate the gross square footage of the upper base floors.

Open Space
The project complies as it exceeds 13,967 SF of publicly-accessible open space.
**Design Concept**
The project concept creates a set of four distinct volumes that break down the overall identity of the building, help it relate to the lower scale fabric of the neighborhood, and provide three unique and textural cladding systems. While the concept achieves these goals, the overall form lacks elegance.

Architectural language: The three components to the design are expressed through different cladding systems which intend to reference local materials and effects. The base is horizontally proportioned with a deeper frame to respond to the more historic South of Market cladding types; the mid portion references the copper found on other historic structures in the city; and the upper level is more contemporary, light in color and atmospheric like the Bay Area fog. Each of these systems is appealing but they do not support a cohesive design.

Massing: The massing strategy is an inventive way to address the bulk controls without mimicking them and provides open space as well. Still, the collection of the elements lacks a gracefulness or programmatic benefit.

Site Relationships: The project conforms to expected ground floor use and access. There are no larger ideas expressed about connecting to the larger district and the relationship to Natoma is underdeveloped.

Open Space
Open space is provided on the ground, 8th, 10th, 11th, and 25th levels. The conceptual design for the publicly-accessible open space at Main and Howard Streets appears inventive, playful, and interactive. It uses landscape to address storm water retention. These ideas are replicated on the outdoor terraces on the tower as well.

Ground Floor
The ground floor includes two retail spaces, at 3,915 SF and 8,670 SF respectively. The latter is larger than the preferred maximum 5,000 SF space. The retail spaces are not well connected to either the corner open space or Natoma Street. They also are currently showing a loading bay adjacent to Natoma Street which should be located underground through the garage entrance.

Parking
The proposed 67 parking spaces are located in three levels of below-grade parking. The loading dock is at street level adjacent to Natoma.

**Sustainability**
The proposal does not indicate its LEED certification goals. The proposal describes one architectural element, the curtain wall system, which will use a deep frame to create exterior shading. The proposed landscape includes green walls, storm water collection systems, bioswales, and light-colored paving.

**Conclusions**
The design executes a clear concept. The result is a materially appealing but formally awkward design. Of the four, this proposal offers the most inventive and well-considered ground level open space landscape design for Parcels M1 and N3.

**Planning Code Considerations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Requirement</th>
<th>Calculation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Office use</td>
<td>633,590 SF</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail use</td>
<td>12,585 SF</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building Height</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulk Controls</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open Space</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Open Space**: The project complies as it exceeds 12,672 SF of publicly-accessible open space.
Kilroy Realty / Pelli Clarke Pelli
Team Proposal

Design Concept
The design concept is a set of rotating and interlocking volumes that provide views and open space at different levels. The cladding enhances this effect by creating a pattern of angled lids that increase the sense of rotation. The “walking” columns located at the ground level are intended to enhance this effect as well.

Architectural language: The project expresses its idea at small, medium, and large scales through material, spatial, and formal choices. The effect creates, at the big scale, an overall form that is dynamic and, at the small scale, more detailed material choices that give the pedestrian a heightened experience. The patterned cladding of the tower is inventive and three-dimensionally textured. The base element is clad with a more fine grain material to offer a more detailed effect where it would be seen close up.

Massing: The rotating volumes are intended to connect to specific viewpoints towards the Golden Gate Bridge, the Bay Bridge, and the Transbay Park. The effect is a more dynamic set of forms that are shaped at both top and bottom ends to indicate a shearing effect.

Site Relationships: The project proposes significant retail and access points along all facades (assumed but not shown on Beale and Natoma Streets) creating the potential for a vibrant ground level and active interface between the inside and the outside. It also provides public environments on both sides of the off-site driveway offering a compelling visual bracket. This better connects the open spaces and creates a more seamless and continuous public realm environment that extends to Natoma Street.

Open Space
The open space at Howard and Main Streets, although conceptual and diagrammatic, is well programmed and connected to the larger identity of the site. The project also offers compelling and protected open spaces at the 8th, 29th, and 45th levels.

Ground Floor
The ground level use is primarily retail with an appropriately-sized lobby and building core elements. The southeast corner retail is well connected to the public realm and wraps around towards the driveway side allowing it to have a direct visual interface with the nearby open space. The retail in the opposite corner along Beale Street is large, perhaps just over the preferred 5,000 SF size, and is not shown to have openings along the street edge. It does appear to wrap overly around to Natoma with the potential for a connected interface. The Natoma frontage is almost entirely retail with the preferred one garage and loading entry. Of the four proposals, this project has the best and most playful ground level design.

Parking
The 65 parking spaces are located underground in three levels of garage. Loading is located on the ground level but not at the street edge.

Sustainability
The project seeks LEED Platinum certification above the required level. Sustainability features include: a rain garden, high performance façade, sun-shading devices that are integrated into the cladding system, and bioremediation.

Conclusions
This is a compelling project with both strong architectural and ground floor concepts. One important reservation, however, is that while the project expresses a clear idea, the resulting architectural aesthetic results in a slightly geometrically mannerist or stylistic affectation that would need further refinement. While the idea is contemporary, this sense of style over conceptual depth is not.

Planning Code Considerations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Use</th>
<th>Area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Office use</td>
<td>696,551 SF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail use</td>
<td>13,100 SF</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Building Height
The project complies.

Bulk Controls
The building does not meet the mass and bulk controls. The lower tower has an average floorplate of 17,400 SF.

Open Space
The project complies as it exceeds 13,931 SF of publicly-accessible open space.
Golub / The John Buck Company / Goettsch / SCB / Butler Enterprise
Team Proposal

Design Concept
This proposal does not express a larger conceptual idea that establishes its overall architectural language, massing, or site relationships.

Architectural language: The design proposal expresses conventional and homogenous curtainwall cladding modulated only by changes in massing and a horizontal band every five levels. The design does not change its architectural expression where the tower meets the ground level; it merely stops two floors above the street level and misses the opportunity to change in scale to meet the pedestrian environment. The entry and ground level façade is unremarkable. The one unique feature in the design proposal is the set of six outdoor balconies on the tower at the northern corner of the building. This is a provocative idea to provide large open spaces for occupants and requires careful study and programming to assure its benefit. It results in interesting amenities and may provide an interesting aesthetic from afar, but will likely not be compelling from a pedestrian viewpoint.

Massing: The massing concept begins with a serrated volume resulting in a set of conjoined elements. These are then reduced in height to create different floor plate sizes appropriate to the bulk and massing requirements. This results in a larger bulk at the base that establishes the streetwall and a significant reduction of mass towards the top of the tower. The massing reads as a set of conjoined elements formed through the extrusion of plan shapes. As the elements are not clearly distinguished from one another as interlocking, conjoined, or adjacent through further articulation or material detailing, the overall configuration is awkward and inconsistent. The massing does not offer any performative effects other than to provide space for the balconies and to reduce the mass at the top.

Site Relationships: Lacking an innovative site idea, the project conforms to expected ground floor use although the lobby is excessively large reducing the retail area. The relationships between the two corner open spaces are underdeveloped and inadequate. There are no larger or interesting ideas expressed about connecting to the larger district and the relationship to Natoma is underdeveloped.

Open Space
The project offers additional outdoor space with the inclusion of a series of 1,200 SF balconies every five floors in the tower that adds 18,500 SF of common open space. There are also open spaces on the 13th and 28th floors. The proposed design for the Main Street and Howard Street open space is not well connected to Howard Street, nor is it programmed or designed to encourage active use. The design would need significant conceptual, spatial, and programmatic development.

Ground Floor
The proposed ground floor includes a large lobby, two small retail spaces, four loading docks and a garage entry along Natoma Street. The lobby is excessively large (well beyond the preferred maximum 40’ or 25% of frontage) and not well connected to the corner open space at Howard and Beale Streets. The retail spaces are minimal and their connections to both the lobby and both streets are unclear. The loading is excessive and should be located underground and accessible from the parking garage entry. Currently, the loading and garage entries in combination result in nearly 70’ (over 50% of the entire elevation) of curb cut and driveway access on Natoma Street.

Parking
The 114 parking spaces are located in two below-grade garage levels.

Sustainability
The project proposes LEED Gold certification which is the minimum required. Sustainability features include water use reduction systems, solar shading, recycled, renewable or regional materials use, and the balconies for additional fresh air.

Conclusions
Overall, this design proposal is unimaginative, and would result in an unremarkable addition to the district. The ground floor would need significant improvement to appropriately contribute to the public realm. The balconies, the one inventive feature, would need to thoughtfully considered and designed to work successfully.

Planning Code Considerations
Office use: 744,630 SF
Retail use: 4,650 SF (approx.)

Building Height
The project complies.

Bulk Controls
The project complies.

Open Space
The project complies as it exceeds 14,892 SF of publicly-accessible open space.